DRAFT

MINUTES
Committee on Ways and Means
June 6, 2017 @ 3:30 p.m.
10th Floor Conference Room, City Hall

CALL TO ORDER
The meeting was called to order at 3:32 p.m.

ROLL CALL
Councilmember Jody Washington, Chair
Councilmember Kathie Dunbar, Vice Chair- absent
Councilmember Carol Wood, Member

OTHERS PRESENT
Sherrie Boak, Council Staff
Mindy Biladeau, Downtown Development Authority
Chief Talifarro
Denise Estee
Lynne Meade
Brett Kaschinske, Parks and Recreation Director
Heather Sumner, Assistant City Attorney
Joseph Abood, Chief Deputy City Attorney –arrived at 4:25 p.m.

Minutes
MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER WOOD TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM MAY 22, 2017 AS PRESENTED. MOTION CARRIED 2-0.

Minutes from May 31, 2017 will be addressed at the next meeting.

Public Comment
Ms. Estee asked to be added on the agenda under "Other" to talk about the May 22, 2017 Legacy Report and also about her continued concerns on the Teamster 580 Retirees and 2004 Tie Bar issued.

Discussion/Action
RESOLUTION – Proposed Fees for Marshall Park Sand Volleyball
Council Member Washington pulled the item off the agenda, and asked Mr. Kaschinske if he had any comments. Mr. Kaschinske informed the Committee that it was put in after the budget was presented, and they are looking to partner with MARVA, a local volleyball association. He noted that currently the revenues of the courts do not cover the cost of the material that is

needed for the courts. Mr. Kaschinske added that they are currently looking into entering into an agreement with the volleyball association to run the courts.

Council Member Washington informed Mr. Kaschinske that she would be pulling the resolution until further notice because she had serious questions on the funds and fees with the Parks and Recreation Department.

RESOLUTION – Set the Public Hearing for the Principal Shopping District (PSD) Assessment for FY2018 to FY2020

Ms. Biladeau explained that the PSD was established in 1996, with no increase since then. Their determination would be that with the rate of inflation currently it could be a 55% increase, so the Board is recommending 3% increase for district A over the 3 years, totaling 9% from 2018-2020. District A is the Downtown area and B and C would remain status quo, but the Board will review for renewal again every 3 years.

Council Member Washington asked for the subsidy given to Downtown Inc. in the budget, besides the $100,000 for wayfinding signage, and asked if this 3% annually for the next (3) years will cut into that subsidy and will then require a lower amount of subsidy. Ms. Bennett and Mr. Brewer were not able to provide the numbers at this time.

Ms. Biladeau explained that after researching they could not find any information on why it had been 21 years since the last assessment, but the assessment costs do cover maintenance for downtown, such as removing the trash from the 80 public trash can, sidewalk clearing, and beautification.

Council Member Wood asked Ms. Bennet for a detailed account of how much of the assessment the City is paying on their City owned properties within the A District. Council Member Washington also reiterated her earlier question on the subsidy and asked Council staff to follow up if there was no response by Tuesday, June 13th.

After a discussion on when the hearing would be held, and when the assessment would appear on the taxes, it was clarified by Ms. Bennett that the assessment would be on the Winter bill and that deadline is October 31st.

Council Member Wood asked if they notify the property owners, and Ms. Bennett and Ms. Biladeau both confirmed that the Clerk's office notifies the owners of the hearing.

Council Member Washington encouraged Ms. Biladeau to hold discussion with her Board on gradual increases instead of waiting so many years.

Council Member Washington moved the agenda item to the June 20th meeting to set the hearing, since the assessments will not go on the taxes until the Winter 2017 taxes. The item was put on pending in expectation of receiving the information requested from Ms. Bennett and Finance.

Sole Source Purchase; Plante Moran Initiative Planning Study, Fire Department

Chief Talifarro detailed to the Committee that this project was Phase 2 of the 2012 study, and in that study they reviewed and determined regionalism and consolidation. Based on the Phase 1 they have begun training and special tactical teams, along with certifications for grants. The next step is to obtain formal agreements to proceed on an analysis with the six (6) Departments, those being Lansing, Meridian, East Lansing, Delta, Delhi and Lansing Township. These Departments share responsibilities, but each municipality responds to their areas.

Council Member Washington asked if the noted $31,500 was the cost to Lansing and if any other municipality paid. Chief Talifarro confirmed that currently the only two entities in the program are the City of Lansing and the City of East Lansing, and they also pay $31,500. If the structure of the program is agreed upon by the other 4 Departments they will also contibute.

Council Member Washington pointed out to Staff that when the City decided to agree to share the Fire Chief, Council was told it was a year trial period and they would come back to Council after that year for review, discussion and future determination. She noted to Chief Talifarro and Ms. Bennett that that process did not happen. Council Member Washington stated she would pursue that issue with the new Mayor in January 2018.

Council Member Wood asked where the sole source of $31,500 was listed in the budget. Ms. Bennett stated it was within the Fire Department, but she could not provide the exact line item. Council Member Wood then informed the Committee that she had spoken to Mark Meadows from East Lansing in February, and he informed her that the City of Lansing was not paying, and it did not appear in the budget this year either she noted.

Ms. Bennett stated the dollars are in the FY2017 Fire Operating Budget Funds. Chief Talifarro stated his understanding was that East Lansing required Council approval, and the way the document was presented the City of Lansing City Council did not have to approve. Council Member Wood asked if there were using public safety millage dollars. Chief Talifarro assured her that this had nothing to do with the millage.

Chief Talifarro stated he would email the 2012 study to Council Staff to forward to the Committee.

MOTON BY COUNCIL MEMBER WOOD TO PLACE THE SOLE SOURCE FROM PLANTE MORAN FOR THE FIRE DEPARTMENT INITIATIVE PLANNING STUDY ON FILE. MOTION CARRIED 2-0.

<u>Sole Source Purchase; Segal Waters Consulting Group, Human Resources</u>
Ms. Riley was not present and Council Staff was asked to request her presence at the next meeting, June 20, 2017. This agenda item was moved to the next meeting on June 20, 2017.

Chief Talifarro stated he would email the 2012 report once he gets back to his office due to technical difficulty in the room, however wanted the Committee to know his understanding was that he was present to review it with the Committee and as a Sole Source he was not asking for approval. Council Member Washington acknowledged his statement.

<u>OTHER</u>
Ms. Estee referred the Committee to the FHT Legacy report of May 11, 2016 and presented pages from the document to them. She then noted her opinion that in regards to the health care issue and Teamster retiree benefit summary, that information given to the consultant was incorrect and inaccurate.

Ms. Meade added that in the report the retirees that paid for their health care, their dollar amount maximum was incorrect in the report. They should be $125, $225 and $325, but they are not noted that way in this study. Ms. Bennett attempted to explain that the information was actuarial information, and they have to disclose their governing document, and the reports disclose that. The previous reports were general, and by the current actuary they did speak and agreed upon assumptions going forward.

Council Member Washington asked how they came up with the 2004 figure. Ms. Bennett noted it is current City policy that the date in which a retiree retires, follows active employees.

Council Member Wood asked for a copy of that contract that states that, from Ms. Bennett. Ms. Meade added to the conversation that back to 1982 the contracts say it follows actives, and addresses the “plan” but it never made mention on the monetary value. Her opinion was that in 2010 there was a unilateral change and they decided to retro back to 2004 and no agreement with Union was made what so ever.

Ms. Estee then outlined her second topic of discussion, the 2004 tie-bar. Ms. Estee went through the timeline for Council Member Washington that was spent with the Retirement Board in 2014 who could not assist them, then onto the Council Internal Auditor who referred them to the Committee on Ways and Means in 2014. Ms. Estee spent 2015-2016 in Committee meetings asking for their assistance in having the City Attorney determine and provide information on retiree health care. Ms. Estee concluded that in the end of 2016 she expected a written report, but was advised as the Committee was that there was no memo from Ms. McIntyre the previous City Attorney in 2015-2016 that spoke to this. At this time Ms. Estee was asking to be a continual reoccurring topic of discussion on the Committee agenda until her issues are addressed.

Council Member Washington asked for a timeline on the process, and also times to review a document that Ms. Estee presented to the Committee.

Mr. Abood asked who Ms. Meade was representing. Ms. Meade answered that she was representing language in the contract, and Ms. Estee stated to Mr. Abood she was a present as a retiree and understands that Unions do not represent retirees.

Council Member Washington informed Council Staff to add the requested topic to the upcoming agendas.

ADJOURN
Adjourn at 4:30 p.m.
Submitted by,
Sherrie Boak, Recording Secretary
Lansing City Council
Approved by the Committee on________________