



AGENDA
Committee of the Whole
Monday, July 29, 2019 @ 5:30 p.m.
Tony Benavides Lansing City Council Chambers
City Hall 10th Floor

Council Member Wood, Chairperson
Council Member Spadafore, Vice Chairperson

- 1. Call to Order**
- 2. Roll Call**
- 3. Minutes**
 - July 22, 2019
- 4. Public Comment on Agenda Items (Up to 3 Minutes)**
- 5. Discussion/Action:**
 - A.) RESOLUTION – Immigration
 - B.) DISCUSSION - Ord. Amendment Chapter 288 Section 288.21 – Chief Strategy Officer
 - C.) DISCUSSION – State of Michigan Department of Treasury RE: Tax Management Associates: Follow up Review of the City of Lansing's 2019 Assessment Roll
- 6. Other**
- 7. Adjourn**

The City of Lansing's Mission is to ensure quality of life by:

- I. Promoting a vibrant, safe, healthy and inclusive community that provides opportunity for personal and economic growth for residents, businesses and visitors
- II. Securing short and long term financial stability through prudent management of city resources.
- III. Providing reliable, efficient and quality services that are responsive to the needs of residents and businesses.
- IV. Adopting sustainable practices that protect and enhance our cultural, natural and historical resources.
- V. Facilitating regional collaboration and connecting communities



5:30 P. M.

DATE July 29, 2019

Please print

Mary E. Reynolds

DRAFT



MINUTES **Committee of the Whole** **Monday, July 22, 2019 @ 5:30 p.m.** **Tony Benavides Lansing City Council Chambers**

CALL TO ORDER

Council Member Wood called the meeting called to order at 5:30 p.m.

PRESENT

Councilmember Kathie Dunbar
Councilmember Jeremy A. Garza
Councilmember Adam Hussain- excused
Council Member Brian T. Jackson
Councilmember Peter Spadafore
Councilmember Patricia Spitzley
Councilmember Jody Washington
Councilmember Carol Wood

OTHERS PRESENT

Sherrie Boak, Council Staff
Jim Smiertka, City Attorney
Samantha Harkins, Executive Staff, Mayor's Office
Lisa Hagen, Assistant City Attorney & Council Legal Analyst
Eric Brewer, Council Internal Auditor
Chief Yankowski, LPD Chief
Mary Reynolds
Loretta Stanaway
Art Hasbrook
Matt Oudssema

Minutes

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER WASHINGTON TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM JULY 8, 2019 AS PRESENTED. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

Public Comment on Agenda Items

Ms. Stanaway spoke in support of the LPD, but noted in her opinion they were understaffed.

DRAFT

Mr. Hasbrook spoke in opposition to the data management in the LPD, and the timeline it takes to review information from accidents and other incidents. He then appealed the fees that are charged in FOIA costs.

Mary Reynolds spoke in support of the LPD.

PRESENTATION

Lansing Police Department Annual Report

Chief Yankowski began his presentation, acknowledged his staff, Ms. Reddish on the creation of the report and then acknowledged the Mayor, Council, the LPD Board and citizens for their support. Lastly Chief Yankowski acknowledged all the LPD officers for keeping the community safe. The presentation moved into a summary of the report in the packet on each department. Council President Wood asked what the difference is between an informal and formal complaint in Internal Affairs. The Chief confirmed any time a citizen wants to file a complaint, they can do it with Internal Affairs or the Commission Investigator. All complaints get investigated by Internal Affairs. With the formal complaint, if a complaint is sustained, it is subject to discipline. If it is an informal complaint, they document the complaint, offer training but do not handle it as a form of discipline. Citizens have the options of both, along with the same process with an employee-based complaint. Chief Yankowski continued on patrol statistics in the report, and confirmed that traffic report is included in the report along with accident reports in the records management. Regarding the Community Service Unit, it was expanded over last 5 years and in 2019 the 11th community policing officer was added. Regarding the G.R.E.A.T. program, he noted that there are 8 officers going into the schools teaching kids to make good choices and decisions. In the summer they will continue to education and provide guidance to the kids by attending community events. The Chief continued his presentation highlighting the Citizens Academy, Youth Academy, traffic unit, honor guard, and Explorers noted in the report. Council Member Spitzley asked about the hiring process with officers retiring. Chief Yankowski informed the Committee that they are staffed +4 and in the process for hiring for 2020 class with the goal to recruit, hire and train, so by the time of a retirement they are ahead. The department hired 31 in 2018 with 68-69% minority candidates. Council Member Spadafore asked the status of the Police Social Worker position that was budgeted in 2018. Chief Yankowski confirmed the employee began in January 2019, has been doing a lot of networking, and will be working on a contact team to provide additional resources for the opioid epidemic. Lastly, the presentation highlighted training, mobile command and technology.

Council Member Jackson asked for details on the public comments earlier on the data management and the time to provide details. Chief Yankowski stated that the LPD is always looking for the best software, and with a video component they need to make sure certain details and faces are redacted along with redacting radio traffic.

Council Member Spadafore stepped away for the meeting at 6:05 p.m.

He continued noting that they are looking at new equipment to speed up the information search, and currently there are five (5) employees in central records that go through all FOIA requests.

Council Member Spadafore returned to the meeting at 6:08 p.m.

Council Member Jackson acknowledged the Chief for his years of service, then inquired in the internal affairs department. Chief Yankowski noted the majority of the complaints are handled by Internal Affairs, and there are two officers; 1 lieutenant and 1 sergeant and they have not been in the LPD for anywhere between 7-10 years. Any resident can file a complaint over the phone, text, emails or in person. The majority of the complaints are employee based internal

DRAFT

not external. With citizen complaints they will come to residents' homes and they not have to sign anything. There are other options for the citizens including the civilian investigator, who is not a police officer, and they can file a complaint. This investigator is not housed in LPD. Internal Affairs is the "keeper of records" the Citizen Investigator completes the report. Council President Wood referenced the complaint brochure that is available to citizens that outlines the process for all the options and encouraged all Council Members to distribute them at their neighborhood meetings. Council Member Spitzley also noted that a complaint can always be filed with the City Attorney office as well, and Council Member Washington added that the same process used by the LPD is used by the State of Michigan Department of Corrections. Council Member Jackson asked for efforts to find a policy to make more accommodating and have complaint heard and the Chief confirmed the LPD is open-minded to any suggestions on solutions or ideas.

DISCUSSION/ACTION

DISCUSSION/RESOLUTION – Changes in 2019 Council and Committee of the Whole Dates

Council President Wood proposed a discussion on moving the dates in November and December 2019 due to the holidays and still able to address business before year end. Council Member Jackson asked why the proposed changes. Council Member Spadafore clarified November 25th falls during the week of Thanksgiving and by moving those meetings into December it would allow 2 Committee and Council meetings in December where there is currently one. Council Member Dunbar noted she might have a conflict with attendance at the new dates of December 16th meetings. Council Member Spitzley recapped that Committee of the Whole and Council will now meet December 2nd and 16th.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE RESOLUTION TO AMEND THE COUNCIL MEETING DATES FOR NOVEMBER AND DECEMBER 2019. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

DISCUSSION/RESOLUTION – Council Appeal to the State on Fireworks Law Changes

Council President Wood briefly noted the proposed Resolution would ask the State legislation to consider making changes in the Fireworks law. The resolution also speaks to the statement made to Council by Mayor Schor he would also submit a letter in support of the resolution to the State as well.

MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER SPADAFORE TO APPROVE THE RESOLUTION FOR AN APPEAL ON THE STATE OF MICHIGAN FIREWORKS LAW AMENDMENTS. MOTION CARRIED 7-0.

Other

Council President Wood referenced a "Late" item for the Council meeting later tonight. She stated it would be introduced out of Committee on Public Safety to address 3801 Walton. She then provided historical information on the property including agreed upon letters from the owner to fix issues, work with community policing, and lack of results. She concluded that per Law, this could proceed to court. Council Member Spadafore asked for confirmation that this resolution was not stating Council was invoking the section to issue subpoenas. Council President Wood confirmed this was going to all be handled by the City Attorney and the courts, with all information gathered by the City Attorney Office. Council Member Spitzley spoke on other items discussed at Committee on the property including providing the owner numerous opportunities to comply, but nothing the property is a health and safety issue. Council President Wood added that the community policing office has also informed the Committee that the tenants are afraid to complain because of eviction. Council Member Garza spoke on the ongoing situation with the property and discussions at Committee. Mr. Smiertka concluded the discussion by clarifying that the process is to authorize the authority

DRAFT

with the resolution to declare it a nuisance then the next action which could be circuit court or other alternatives.

ADJOURN

The meeting was adjourned at 6:39 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by,
Sherrie Boak, Recording Secretary
Lansing City Council
Approved by the Committee on

BY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
RESOLVED BY THE CITY OF LANSING CITY COUNCIL

WHEREAS, the Lansing City Council considers human rights an inalienable fundamental right inherent in all human beings; and

WHEREAS, all sovereign states must comply with all relevant international human rights obligations; and

WHEREAS, there is an influx of individuals and families at the Mexican/US border that have become an international humanitarian crises in need of resolution; and

WHEREAS, thousands are fleeing their home countries because they are in jeopardy of losing their lives and their families due to gangs, human trafficking, persecution, and violence; and

WHEREAS, there have been numerous violations documented regarding violations and abuses against migrants and refugees in transit; and

WHEREAS, there is proof that children are being separated from their families, in many cases with no clear documentation to help track the children's whereabouts; and

WHEREAS, reports are coming regarding appalling conditions in which migrants and refugees are being held in US immigration detention centers that are lacking adequate health care, food, and proper sanitation; and

WHEREAS, the detention waits are lengthy, arbitrary, and inefficient.

NOW THEREFORE be it resolved; the Lansing City Council calls on our federal US government to immediately end all family separation; and

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Lansing City Council calls on our federal US government to ensure all migrants and refugees have access to basic rights, such as water, food, health services, and safe shelter; and

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Lansing City Council calls on our federal US government to work with other nations to mitigate the root causes in the Central American countries that are causing their citizens to flee for safety; and

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Lansing City Council calls on our federal US government to immediately work on immigration reform; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Lansing City Clerk forward this Resolution onto the Michigan legislative delegations upon adoption.

CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER

City of Lansing, Michigan

DRAFT Position Description | June 18, 2019 | **FINAL**

The City of Lansing, Michigan (“City”) is seeking an experienced individual to serve as the Chief Strategy Officer (“CSO”). This executive level position is appointed by the Mayor and serves at-will under contract.

The City of Lansing is a diverse, robust capital city that offers a great place to live, work, and play. The Capitol City hosts the seat of state government, a thriving economy, areas of culture and entertainment, manufacturing, major educational institutions and is centrally located to major areas of interest.

The Chief Strategy Officer will identify, analyze, develop, communicate, oversee, and monitor short-term and critical long-term strategic goals/policies and action plans focused on reducing the City’s unfunded actuarial accrued liabilities for the pension and other post-employment benefits. The successful candidate will possess strong analytical, excellent communication and project management skills. The successful candidate must also be able to handle sensitive information with professionalism and integrity and work well with various stakeholders. The City offers a competitive wage and benefits package.

EDUCATION AND EXPERIENCE PREFERRED:

- Bachelor’s Degree and Master’s Degree in finance, economics, accounting, management, administration, or a related field.
- Five to seven years in finance/administrative and project management
- Experience in strategic planning and execution
- Experience with financially distressed units of government, or turnaround management experience with restructuring or bankruptcy in either the private or public sectors, is strongly preferred
- In-depth knowledge and experience in management, including multi-fund, multi-year budgeting, , governmental accounting, and financial reporting
- Experience in budget presentations, communicating with internal/external stakeholders
- Knowledge of internal control systems over the financial assets and financial record keeping activities
- Knowledge of collective bargaining agreements, including negotiations of contracts
- Knowledge of municipal pension boards / systems, including actuarial reports
- Understanding of risk management
- Experience working with, and deep knowledge of, State and Federal grants, application preparation and submission, reporting requirements, and regulations
- Experience and evidence of ensuring compliance, best practices, and transparency
- Proficient working with financial software/spreadsheets

KNOWLEDGE, SKILLS, AND ABILITIES:

- Excellent verbal, written and interpersonal communication skills
- Evidence of leadership skills – team building and demonstrated ability to work effectively with all staff in all departments, in addition to the persuasive ability to negotiate and influence stakeholders on difficult and necessary actions that need to be taken
- Demonstrated knowledge of continuous improvement principles and practices
- Broad knowledge of financial, programmatic and or performance budgeting, forecasting, and investing public funds
- Knowledge of federal, state, local laws, policies, regulations and procedures relating to financial management
- Ability to generate and communicate cost benefit analyses

CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER

City of Lansing, Michigan

DRAFT Position Description | June 18, 2019 | FINAL

SPECIAL REQUIREMENTS: Must pass a Federal/National criminal background investigation and credit check. Must possess and maintain a valid driver's license. Ability to travel to offsite events and meetings.

A letter of interest, resume and credentials can be sent to Exec.Search@lansingmi.gov

For a complete Job Description, email your request to Exec.Search@lansingmi.gov

The City of Lansing is an Equal Opportunity Employer and a Certified Veteran Friendly Employer.

The information contained in this job description is for compliance with the American with Disabilities Act (A.D.A.) and is not an exhaustive list of the duties performed for this position. Job descriptions are not intended as and do not create employment contracts. The City maintains its status as an at-will employer. Employees can be terminated for any reason not prohibited by law.

The City of Lansing provides reasonable accommodation to applicants and employees with disabilities where appropriate. If you need reasonable accommodation for any part of the application and hiring process, or during employment, notify the Department of Human Resources at (517) 483-4004. Determinations on requests for reasonable accommodation will be made on a case-by-case basis.

INTRODUCTION OF ORDINANCE

Council Member Wood introduced:

An ordinance of the City of Lansing, Michigan, to amend the Lansing Codified Ordinances by amending Chapter 288, Section 288.21 to provide minimum qualifications for a Chief Strategy Officer.

The Ordinance is referred to the Committee of the Whole

RESOLUTION SETTING PUBLIC HEARING BY CITY COUNCIL

Resolved by the City Council of the City of Lansing that a public hearing be set for Monday, August 12, 2019 at 7 p.m. in City Council Chambers, Tenth Floor, Lansing City Hall, 124 West Michigan Avenue, Lansing, Michigan, for the purpose of amending the Lansing Codified Ordinances by amending Chapter 288, Section 288.21 to provide minimum qualifications for a Chief Strategy Officer.

Interested Persons are invited to attend this Public Hearing

ORDINANCE NO. _____

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF LANSING, MICHIGAN, TO AMEND THE
LANSING CODIFIED ORDINANCES BY AMENDING CHAPTER 288 SECTION 288.21 TO
PROVIDE MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS FOR A CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER.

THE CITY OF LANSING ORDAINS:

Section 1. That Chapter 288, Section 288.21, of the Codified Ordinances of the City of
Lansing, Michigan, be and is hereby added to read as follows:

288.21 CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER

(A) *TRAINING AND EXPERIENCE*. HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE A MASTER'S DEGREE IN
FINANCE, ECONOMICS, ACCOUNTING, MANAGEMENT, ADMINISTRATION, OR A
RELATED FIELD. ADDITIONALLY, HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE FIVE TO SEVEN YEARS
IN FINANCE/ADMINISTRATIVE OR PROJECT MANAGEMENT.

(B) *KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS*. HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE BROAD KNOWLEDGE OF
FINANCIAL PROGRAMMATIC AND/OR PERFORMANCE BUDGETING, FORECASTING,
AND INVESTING PUBLIC FUNDS. IN ADDITION, HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE
DEMONSTRATED KNOWLEDGE OF CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT PRINCIPLES AND
PRACTICES. HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE KNOWLEDGE OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING
AGREEMENTS, INCLUDING NEGOTIATION OF CONTRACTS. HE OR SHE SHALL
HAVE EXPERIENCE IN STRATEGIC PLANNING AND EXECUTION. HE OR SHE
SHALL HAVE KNOWLEDGE OF MUNICIPAL PENSION BOARDS/SYSTEMS,
INCLUDING ACTUARIAL REPORTS.

1 (C) *REPORTING*. THE CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER SHALL REPORT ON A QUARTERLY
2 BASIS TO CITY COUNCIL REGARDING ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS AND WORK
3 PERFORMED.

4 Section 2. All ordinances, resolutions or rules, parts of ordinances, resolutions or rules
5 inconsistent with the provisions are repealed.

6 Section 3. Should any section, clause or phrase of this ordinance be declared to be
7 invalid, the same shall not affect the validity of the ordinance as a whole, or any part thereof
8 other than the part so declared to be invalid.

9 Section 4. This ordinance shall take effect on the 30th day after enactment, unless given
10 immediate effect by City Council, and shall expire December 31, 2027.

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
Approved as to form:

City Attorney

Dated: _____



GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

RACHAEL EUBANKS
STATE TREASURER

June 28, 2019

SHARON L. FRISCHMAN, ASSESSOR
CITY OF LANSING, INGHAM COUNTY
124 W. MICHIGAN AVE 3RD FLOOR
LANSING, MI 48933

ANDY SCHOR, MAYOR
CITY OF LANSING, INGHAM COUNTY
124 W MICHIGAN AVE 9TH FLOOR
LANSING, MI 48933

Dear Ms. Frischman and Mr. Schor:

As indicated at the time of the State Tax Commission's (STC) approval of your Audit of Minimum Assessment Requirements (AMAR) corrective action plan, this letter serves as notification that a Follow-Up Review of the Lansing's 2019 assessment roll will be taking place. The Department of Treasury has contracted Tax Management Associates (TMA) to perform Follow-Up Reviews to determine if the deficiencies detailed in the STC approved corrective action plans have been corrected and implemented by the jurisdiction.

In preparation for this, you should refer back to the Lansing's AMAR review and the STC approved corrective action plan outlining how and the specific dates when each deficiency will be corrected. Please provide copies of the following documents to TMA via amar_followup@tma1.com:

- Form 4142 if there were PRE denial(s) issued for 2019.
- 2019 Economic Condition Factors (ECF) Analysis Grid/Spreadsheet, calculation and documentation for the INDUSTRIAL property class.
- After we review your 2019 database, the auditor will email you a random sample of 2019 Forms 5076 (personal property). These will be copies of the originals filed with the assessor.

You will also need to provide a complete backup of the 2019 database to the State of Michigan's FTP site. The State of Michigan's FTP site is located under the "Help" tool in the BS&A software. Enclosed are detailed instructions from BS&A on how to back up your database. If you do not use BS&A Software, please contact TMA for additional instructions.



Andy Schor, Mayor

CITY ASSESSORS OFFICE

Sharon Frischman, MMAO
City Assessor

3rd Floor City Hall
124 West Michigan Avenue
Lansing, Michigan 48933
(517) 483-7624
FAX: (517) 483-4101
www.lansingmi.gov/City-Assessor

July 29, 2019
Memorandum

To: Eric Brewer, City Council Auditor

From: Sharon Frischman, MMAO, City Assessor

Re: Audit of Minimum Assessing Requirements (AMAR)

Eric, I would like to offer an explanation of the recent correspondence from the State Tax Commission regarding an AMAR follow up.

These audits are performed on a regular, rotating basis to ensure that local units are applying good assessing practices.

I have supplied the AMAR checklist to you and will go through it without using too much technical assessing jargon. I will only address the items that are not self-explanatory.

CODs and PRD measure how uniformly we are assessing property.

4022 and 4023 are final reports on assessed values and whether we are assessing property between 49 and 50% of value.

Land value maps simply depict the value placed on the property. The STC has granted us permission to have these maps available electronically (which we do).

Economic Condition Factors – use of these factors ensures that we are using market data to determine values in a uniform manner.

Land values should not have adjustments to the value without an explanation.

The assessment should be based on 50% of the calculated true cash value and should not have an “override” for the assessment. We had quite a few of these due to a practice during 2012 through 2015 to place an override on the value after a Michigan Tax Tribunal change. This is no longer the practice.

Also, please note that the totals on the assessment roll or tax roll are NEVER altered due to an AMAR. Therefore, no changes are made in tax collected. It is an audit of assessing practices only.



Andy Schor, Mayor

CITYASSESSORS OFFICE

Sharon Frischman, Assessor

3rd Floor City Hall
124 West Michigan Avenue
Lansing, Michigan 48933
(517) 483-7624
FAX: (517) 483-4101
www.lansingmi.gov/City-Assessor

April 3, 2018

Kelli Sobel
Michigan Department of Treasury
P.O. Box 30471
Lansing, MI 48909

Re: Corrective Action Plan, AMAR results

Requirements not met:

Does the local unit have proper ECFs?

As the notes mention, we did meet the requirements for residential and commercial property. Only 1% of our real property parcels are classed industrial. Gathering enough sales data to analyze and produce reliable results for an ECF determination is difficult without some assistance from Ingham County Equalization. As you know, the city is tasked with determining value annually regardless of how much data is available. We have worked with Ingham County Equalization and have performed a review of all industrial property for the 2018 assessment roll. Land value tables were simplified, ECFs applied and each industrial parcel was reviewed individually.

Does the local unit have proper land value maps?

The City of Lansing has a little over 40,000 real property parcels. Because we are an older city, many residential parcels are very small. In order to produce land value maps that can be read, we would need to print hundreds of them. This would be very costly and time consuming. We have recently applied for and been approved to have an electronic assessment roll. We are now able to print land value maps electronically. If acceptable to the State Tax Commission, we propose to print the land value maps to a file that can be stored electronically and printed on demand.

Does the local unit have proper land value determinations?

The 2017 roll had 1,712 parcels that had a land adjustment without a reason. The 2018 roll now has 317 parcels that have adjustment without a reason. While this represents less than the acceptable 1%, we will continue to review land values and remove all adjustments that do not have a reason.

Did the local unit properly process any Small Taxpayer Exemptions that were received?

The city received 1,113 5076 forms, a sampling of 27 were pulled from files. We did not process any forms received after the filing deadline as a matter of policy. I am probably one of the strictest Assessors when it comes to processing late personal property forms. It is unclear whether the problem was a missing form or a missing signature on a form. I will counsel staff to make sure that they are not processing any forms that are unsigned. We will also implement a review process that ensures that any parcels that may have been previously exempt are returned to the roll if a 5076 form is not received for the current year.

Please feel free to contact me for further clarification if needed.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Sharon Frischman', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Sharon Frischman, MMAO
City of Lansing Assessor
Direct 517 483 4136
Sharon.frischman@lansingmi.gov

C: Andy Schor, City of Lansing Mayor
Doug Stover, Ingham County Equalization Director



STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY
LANSING

RICK SNYDER
GOVERNOR

NICK A. KHOURI
STATE TREASURER

March 22, 2018

Andy Schor, Mayor
Lansing City, Ingham County
124 W. Michigan Avenue
Lansing, MI 48933

RECEIVED

MAR 28 2018

ASSESSORS OFFICE

Dear Andy Schor:

Tax Management Associates recently conducted an Audit of Minimum Assessing Requirements (AMAR) on behalf of the State Tax Commission in your local unit. Following is a summary of the audit findings:

Review Item	Requirement Met (Yes/No)
Does the local unit have proper ECF's?	No
Does the local unit have proper land value maps?	No
Does the local unit have proper land value determinations?	No
Does the true cash value on the record cards match the assessment roll?	Yes
Does the local unit conduct an annual personal property canvas?	Yes
Did the local unit properly process any Small Business Taxpayer Exemptions that were received?	No
Does the local unit have poverty exemption guidelines?	Yes
Do the local unit poverty exemption guidelines include an asset test?	Yes
Did the Board of Review meet the statutory requirements in granting poverty exemption and follow local unit policies?	Yes
Did the July/December Board of Review meet their statutory requirements?	Yes
Did the local unit meet the requirements of MCL 211.27b regarding failure to file a Property Transfer Affidavit?	Yes

A copy of the AMAR Review with detailed comments regarding each item, is enclosed. An electronic version of the form, which includes links that provide more specific information regarding each requirement is available on the State Tax Commission's website at www.michigan.gov/statetaxcommission.

Please provide a corrective action plan no later than **April 23, 2018** outlining how each requirement that was not met will be corrected, as well as specific dates when the deficiency will be corrected. Please note that specific dates are required so that we may determine the date of

AMAR Review

Page 2

March 22, 2018

any necessary follow up review. Failure to submit a plan to correct each item and a date by which item will be corrected will result in the rejection of your corrective action plan.

The 2018 AMAR review includes several background questions that are designed to gather information and to ensure that local units review their policies and procedures as it relates to exemptions, PRE denials, forms filed with County Equalization and statistical information. We ask that local units review this information, particularly where an item was marked no, and discuss these issues with their assessor. No corrective action plan on these items is required, however they will be checked again at the follow up review.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 517-335-3429.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Kelli Sobel", with a stylized flourish at the end.

Kelli Sobel
Michigan Department of Treasury

Enc: AMAR Review

Cc: City Clerk
City Assessor
Equalization Director

Michigan State Tax Commission
Audit of Minimum Assessing Requirements
AMAR Review Sheet

The State Tax Commission, per MCL 211.10f, has jurisdiction to determine substantial compliance with the requirements of the General Property Tax Act. The AMAR review reflects the minimum assessing requirements of a local unit of government based on statute and STC Rules, Policy, Bulletins and Publications. Local units of government that do not meet one or more of the minimum requirements must submit a corrective action plan detailing how and when the deficiencies will be resolved.

Failure to submit an acceptable corrective action plan, or failure to resolve the deficiencies as outlined within the corrective action plan that is approved by the State Tax Commission, will result in a determination of substantial non-compliance and may result in the State Tax Commission assuming jurisdiction of the assessment roll of the local unit of government. Failure to meet one or more of the minimum AMAR requirements does not automatically result in State Tax Commission assumption of jurisdiction of the assessment roll.

Local Unit Background Information:

Year of Audit: 2018
Name of Local Unit: CITY OF LANSING
Name of County: INGHAM
Name of Assessor: SHARON L. FRISCHMAN
Assessor Certification Level: MMAO 4
Name of Supervisor, City Manager or Mayor: ANDY SCHOR Title: MAYOR
Mailing Address for Supervisor: 124 W Michigan Avenue, Lansing, MI 48933

What date did the assessor certify the assessment roll? L-4037 signed and dated 2-27-17.

What is the Residential Coefficient of Dispersion (COD) for the local unit? Unit had 1,656 valid Residential sales to calculate a COD of 31.10.

What is the Residential Price Related Differential (PRD) for the local unit? Unit had 1,656 valid Residential sales to calculate a PRD of 1.13.

Does the L-4022 in possession of the local unit match the L-4022 in possession of the County Equalization Director and the information uploaded on the L-4023 on the E-File Site?

YES: X NO:

The local unit's L-4022 signed and dated 3-28-17 matches the L-4022 in possession of the County Equalization Director and the information uploaded on the L-4023 on the E-File Site. 40,074 total real parcels with a total value of 2,049,306,300.

MCL 211.7cc requires interest at a rate of 1.25% per month or fraction of a month to be charged to the owner of property that has been issued a PRE denial notice. Upon collecting the interest, MCL 211.7cc also details the required distribution of the interest depending on the governmental unit that issued the denial notice. Was Form 4142 completed and submitted to the Michigan Department of Treasury by a County, City or Township when the State's portion of PRE denial interest is remitted? YES: NO: X

Assessor did not have Form 4142 from PRE denials. Unit had 359 PRE denials from the assessor, 7 from Ingham County and 24 from the Michigan Department of Treasury and these include various years.

Does the local unit have written procedures, including audit procedures, for determining how to grant real property exemptions or remove real property exemptions when the property no longer qualifies for the exemption? YES: NO: X

Auditing procedures determining when real property exemptions are to be removed when the property no longer qualifies were not reviewed. City does have an "Application For Property Tax Exempt Status" to be filled out by the requesting organization.

Assessment Roll Analysis:

1. Does the local unit have properly calculated and appropriately documented Economic Condition Factors that meet State Tax Commission requirements per MCL 211.10e and STC ECF Publications?

Requirement Met: YES: NO: X

Notes:

Assessor did not have an ECF study for the industrial class and relied upon the County Equalization Department's ratio study for the 2017 values. The residential and commercial classes had appropriately documented ECF studies. There are no agricultural parcels. Assessor stated there are little to no sales in the industrial class and that Ingham County does an annual industrial study using the three approaches, which has more information than what she has in the city.

2. Does the local unit have accurate Land Value Maps that meet the State Tax Commission requirements per MCL 211.10e and State Tax Commission Land Value Map Publications?

Requirement Met: YES: NO: X

Notes:

There was no land value map or sales listed to review. The city's GIS is working on this. Spreadsheet analysis utilized to develop land value rates from sales was reviewed. For 2018, assessor has the BS&A GIS program that shows sales listed on color coded maps with matching land rate tables.

3. Does the local unit have Land Value Determinations that are appropriately documented, properly calculated and meet State Tax Commission requirements per MCL 211.10e and State Tax Commission Land Value Determination Publications and less than 1% land adjustments without reason?

Requirement Met: YES: NO: X

Notes:

Unit has 4.27% (1,712 out of 40,074) of parcels with a land adjustment and no reason. 2,751 land adjustments, 1,712 with no reason and 203 with a reason which needs further explanation (size, shape or market adj). Land value analysis was performed and was reviewed during the interview. It was appropriate with documented sales and analysis of front foot rates, square foot rates, site values and/or acreage rates for all property classes in the unit.

4. Does the true cash value on the local unit record cards agree with the true cash value indicated on the assessment roll with less than 1% overrides and less than 1% flat land values – excluding DNR PILT Property (STC Policy)?

Requirement Met: YES: X NO:

Notes:

Unit has 0.46% (185 out of 40,074) of parcels on override.

Unit has 0.62% (247 out of 40,074) flat land values with no reason.

5. Personal Property Review:

- a) Does the local unit conduct an annual personal property canvass?

YES: X NO:

Unit conducts a personal property canvass annually. In 2017, staff went through all buildings, discovering new personal property.

- b) Did the local unit grant any exemptions under MCL 211.9o (Small Business Taxpayer Exemption)?

YES: X NO:

Unit has 2,709 personal property parcels. 1,113 have the Form 5076 Accepted, granting an exemption.

- c) If the answer to item 5b is yes, does a sampling indicate the local unit properly processed the exemptions received? This includes: Form 5076 filled out completely, timely received and received annually. If Form 5076 is not received the exemption is removed, parcel number created for any business that was granted an exemption, ensuring that a parcel with the exemption is not retired, all locations within the local unit are considered when granting the exemption.

Requirement Met: YES: NO: X

Notes:

Based upon a sampling, Form 5076 was received after Feb 10, was not dated by the owner or the Form 5076 was missing.

6. Review of Exemptions Granted under MCL 211.7u (poverty exemptions)

- a) Did the local unit grant any exemptions under MCL 211.7u (Poverty Exemption)?

YES: X NO:

Unit had 13 Poverty Exemptions, all being a partial exemption, granted by the MBOR. 3 requests were denied. JBOR granted 4 partial exemptions and DBOR granted 6 full exemptions.

- b) Does the local unit have poverty exemption guidelines?

YES: X NO:

Unit has their own guidelines that incorporate the Federal guidelines annually.

- c) Does the local unit poverty exemption guidelines include an asset level test?

YES: X NO:

Unit has an asset level test within their charter guidelines for poverty exemption.

- d) Does a sampling of the exemptions granted under MCL 211.7u indicate that the statutory requirements were met and that the local unit policy was followed?

Requirement Met: YES: X NO:

Notes:

Unit had 13 Poverty Exemptions granted by the MBOR, all were partial exemptions. 3 requests were denied. JBOR granted 4 partial poverty exemptions and DBOR granted 6 exemptions. 130 Veteran Exemptions were granted and 1 was denied. The requirements were met following the local unit's policy. A staff employee, responsible for poverty exemption applications, explained a few of the applications and the process used to determine a poverty exemption.

7. Does a sample of the July and December Board of Review actions indicate the Board met the requirements of MCL 211.53b and considered only those items over which they have statutory authority?

Requirement Met: YES: X NO:

Notes:

Based upon a sample, JBOR and DBOR actions indicate the Board met the requirements on those items which they have statutory authority. Several pages of spreadsheets were reviewed from each meeting showing the parcel number, name of person, reason for action and action taken.

8. Does the local unit follow the requirements under MCL 211.27b to levy the interest and penalty for failure to file a Property Transfer Affidavit? If waived did the local unit waive the interest and penalty by resolution and is that resolution kept on file?

Requirement Met: YES: X NO:

Notes:

Unit has a PTA Fines Procedure approved within their ordinance and staff actively bills if applicable. 1,071 transfers, 239 did not have a PTA filed and none had the penalty billed within BS&A. Billing is done in another program.

Comments:

I hereby declare that the foregoing information submitted is a complete and true statement.

Alfonso A Consiglio

Signature

2/14/18

Date

☒ By checking this box, I agree and confirm that the signature I have typed above is the electronic representation of my original, handwritten signature when used on this document and creates a legally-binding contract. I further understand that signing this document using my electronic signature will have the same legally-binding effect as signing my signature using pen and paper.

ORDINANCE NO. _____

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF LANSING, MICHIGAN, TO AMEND THE
LANSING CODIFIED ORDINANCES BY AMENDING CHAPTER 288 SECTION 288.21 TO
PROVIDE MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS FOR A CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER.

THE CITY OF LANSING ORDAINS:

Section 1. That Chapter 288, Section 288.21, of the Codified Ordinances of the City of
Lansing, Michigan, be and is hereby added to read as follows:

288.21 CHIEF STRATEGY OFFICER

(A) *TRAINING AND EXPERIENCE*. HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE A MASTER'S DEGREE IN
FINANCE, ECONOMICS, ACCOUNTING, MANAGEMENT, ADMINISTRATION, OR A
RELATED FIELD. ADDITIONALLY, HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE FIVE TO SEVEN YEARS
IN FINANCE/ADMINISTRATIVE OR PROJECT MANAGEMENT.

(B) *KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS*. HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE BROAD KNOWLEDGE OF
FINANCIAL PROGRAMMATIC AND/OR PERFORMANCE BUDGETING, FORECASTING,
AND INVESTING PUBLIC FUNDS. IN ADDITION, HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE
DEMONSTRATED KNOWLEDGE OF CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT PRINCIPLES AND
PRACTICES. HE OR SHE SHALL HAVE KNOWLEDGE OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING
AGREEMENTS, INCLUDING NEGOTIATION OF CONTRACTS. HE OR SHE SHALL
HAVE EXPERIENCE IN STRATEGIC PLANNING AND EXECUTION. HE OR SHE
SHALL HAVE KNOWLEDGE OF MUNICIPAL PENSION BOARDS/SYSTEMS,
INCLUDING ACTUARIAL REPORTS.

Section 2. All ordinances, resolutions or rules, parts of ordinances, resolutions or rules inconsistent with the provisions are repealed.

Section 3. Should any section, clause or phrase of this ordinance be declared to be invalid, the same shall not affect the validity of the ordinance as a whole, or any part thereof other than the part so declared to be invalid.

Section 4. This ordinance shall take effect on the 30th day after enactment, unless given immediate effect by City Council, and shall expire December 31, 2027.

Approved as to form:

City Attorney

Dated: _____