MINUTES
Committee of the Whole
Special Budget Meeting
Monday, May 1, 2017
City Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER
Council President Spitzley called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

PRESENT
Councilmember Brown Clarke
Councilmember Kathie Dunbar – arrived at 6:01 p.m.
Councilmember Tina Houghton
Councilmember Adam Hussain
Councilmember Patricia Spitzley
Councilmember Jody Washington
Councilmember Carol Wood
Councilmember Jessica Yorko – arrived at 5:04 p.m.

OTHERS PRESENT
Sherrie Boak, Council Staff
Angie Bennett, Finance Director
Eric Brewer, Internal Auditor
Jim Smiertka, City Attorney
Chief Talifarro, LFD
Robert Johnson, Planning & Neighborhood Development
Traci Shell, Parking
Don Kulhanek, Planning & Neighborhood Development
Bill Rieske, Planning & Neighborhood Development

Discussion/Action:
Minutes
MOTION BY COUNCIL MEMBER WOOD TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM APRIL 24, 2017 AS PRESENTED. MOTION CARRIED 6-0.

Public Comment
Mr. Alverez informed the Committee of the recent passing of his son.

Council Member Washington stepped away from the meeting at 5:04 p.m.

Department Budget Presentations

City Attorney

Mr. Smiertka presented his department budget and noted that he is aware the Charter requires he report to the City Council and the Mayor for legal affairs of the City. In regards to staffing he informed the Committee that he has 3 vacancies, and the support staff vacancies are filled with contract employees. The goal is to fill those positions with full time employees, not contracts. He noted that his department participates in an aggressive intern program with MSU Law Criminal Justice. Lastly, he pointed out that his department is projected to be under budget $147,000.

Council Member Washington stepped away from the meeting at 5:08 p.m.

Mr. Smiertka presentation also touched on contracts and litigation lists, 9,169 FOIA requests, review of collective bargaining, grievances, and collaboration with the BWL legal staff. Mr. Smiertka pointed out that they have a new Home Occupation Team that addresses the central data base, and consists of code compliance, LPD, LFD, and BWL who review cases and handle on a collective basis. As part of that, in June they will offer education seminars for the public and not cost.

Council Member Washington returned to the meeting at 5:11 p.m.

As Mr. Smiertka addressed the individual department line items, he did confirmed that there are concerns for an increase because there are cases that are up for trial in Federal court, in addition to a need for outside experts and consultants.

Council Member Wood referred the Committee and Mr. Smiertka to page 11 of 33 in the budget which reflected a large amount in the year end for temporary help. Mr. Smiertka acknowledged that when he started in July 2016 in the start of the fiscal year, there was a lot of temporary help.

Council Member Wood then asked about the next year projection only at $6,500. Mr. Smiertka confirmed he will have some staff under the legal extern program, which they do not get paid for, but get credit.

Council Member Wood asked why there was no budget for supplies. Mr. Smiertka stated that was eliminated and they will use miscellaneous operating for their supplies.

Council Member Wood asked if they have considered purchasing the “nasal ranger device” for testing the air as part of their discussion with the task force with code compliance and LFD for marihuana. Mr. Smiertka admitted they had not looked into it anymore, but the Task Force could explore that, and he would add that to the next task force agenda, along with ways to handle it under the home business percentage.

Council Member Wood asked if the City Attorney office was still using Gallagher Bassett for their 3rd party billing. Mr. Smiertka confirmed they did have an issue with Gallagher Bassett in his first 6 months, but now the office has access to their software and see every claim they are processing for the City. Council Member Brown Clarke asked if they had looked at billing performance outcomes. Mr. Smiertka stated they have not, but their contract is up June, 2017, so the department will look into going out for bid for a different 3rd party.

Council Member Wood asked what the turn-around time was on projects. Mr. Smiertka confirmed his expectations are weekly.

Fire

Council President Spitzley acknowledged Chief Talifarro submitting the requested information to the Council by the deadline.

Chief Talifarro began his presentation, which noted the FY2017 budget at $33 million, and a projection for this year at $33,563,891. This would bring them in roughly $50,000 under budget. They are projecting an increase in personnel costs due to pending retirements.   There are 1.5 mills in the budget which is $3 million in revenue. Currently the Fire Department has 195 staff, 5 which are part time which also includes code enforcement. Of those there are 177 sworn officers including two assistant chiefs.

Council Member Hussain asked for numbers on code enforcement and premise office positions. Chief Talifarro noted there is on position currently vacant. Council Member Hussain then asked for any input from the Chief on code enforcement since it had been under his department for over a year. Chief Talifarro confirmed dramatic improvement in code numbers, and staffing assistance with scheduling. To add additional staff could require space and vehicles, but a complete analysis has not been performed. Council President Spitzley noted there was a half position for premise office that was vacant, and asked how long it had been vacant. The Chief acknowledged it had been for the entire fiscal year, but they plan to run another process for filling the vacancy. The highest priority has been to fill the Fire Officer positions. The department has a home occupation team for medical marihuana, however there are issues there under State law for enforcement, and so they need to consider what Code to look under for enforcement.

The group moved onto nuisances and expectations for code to enforce nuisances and signage.   Council asked the City Internal Auditor to research the code enforcement information from last year's budget for hiring more code enforcement officers. Council Member Washington asked for the Council to consider finding funds specifically for Code compliance for commercial uses.

Council Member Wood asked for additional information on how residents can track their complaints in BSA. The Chief acknowledged the request, stating they are working on better analytics and advocating for a position similar to that in the Fire Department for ESO reporting, BSA, and targeting solutions. Council Member Brown Clarke encouraged them to consider a joint position with IT. Council Member Wood asked for the cost for the system, which the Chief answered it was $30,000-$40,000 and they are working with IT for linkage. Ms. Bennett added that in the FY 2018 IT budget it does include a data analytic position.

Council Member Hussain again asked Mr. Brewer to look at the cost of the position from the past year request for additional code enforcement officers.

Council Member Washington stepped away from the meeting at 6:08 p.m.

Council Member Spitzley asked the Chief to consider how Code Compliance and Council can work with the Department.

The Chief continued with his presentation on the overview of the department, the run volume and the EMS.

Council Member Washington returned to the meeting at 6:11 p.m.

Council Member Wood asked if they track repeat overdoses, and the Chief stated they can pull information and they have a task force looking at that with Ingham County. Council Member Brown Clarke asked how they determine which vehicle is released to response, because she had heard the perception the most expensive vehicles were always responding. The Chief outlined the process, and added that all staff are cross trained as EMT and fire fighters. Council Member Wood asked if they hire anyone that is not trained in both. The Chief stated that if they do, they train them, and they are not allowed to stay on the job if they do not get dual trained. Council Member Dunbar asked if they provide any training for current employees to become paramedics. The Chief stated they are considering the approach with LCC.

The department presentation moved into regional teams and performance indicators. This included Blue Card Incident Management Training, Enhanced use of Social Media, Youth Leadership Academy, Capital Improvements, Maintaining the Insurance Service Office Rating of ISO3.0, and then also Code Enforcement Indicators which showed a small decrease in trash notices from 2016 to 2017, and trash submittals staying consistent.

The Committee asked if the complaints to Code Enforcement could be viewed via the website, what the applications are, and is it through Lansing Connect. Chief Talifarro stated he would verify and get the information to the Council.

The missing video in the power point presentation was sent via email during the meeting to Council staff who sent it onto Council.
Council Member Yorko acknowledged the increase of registered rentals in the BSA system and recognized the work of the department.

Council Member Wood asked for any proposed new positions, the number of current vacancies, how long those were vacant and those filled. She also asked how long the position for Fire Marshall had been open. Chief Talifarro confirmed it had been vacant for a full year, and there is a vacancy for an analysis position.

Council Member Yorko stepped away from the meeting at 6:45 p.m.

Council Member Wood informed the Chief that Ms. Bennett had stated the analysis position was in IT. The Chief noted that part of position is for licensing Medical Marihuana and for the Fire Marshall to inspect those.

Council Member Yorko returned to the meeting at 6:55 p.m.

Council Member Wood asked the status of the union contract, at which the Chief stated it expired in July 2016, but they are still working under it.

Council Member Wood asked where the funds were coming for the equipment, because the millage was for staff in the field not equipment, and also asked what the contractual services were paying for. Chief Talifarro stated that 85% goes towards personnel. The department gets $3 million from the millage and a $34 million budget, putting the base resources toward personnel. They have contracted for code enforcement.

Council Member Wood asked about the regional cooperation, noting the residents agreed to the 5 year millage for their City, but there is a concern with those funds being used for employees to work outside the City.

Council Member Washington asked the Chief how many retirees he will have this year. Chief Talifarro stated he expected 8.

Council Member Houghton stepped away from the meeting at 6:58 p.m.

Council President Spitzley asked Mr. Boyce about the recent Ingham County IT issues. Mr. Boyce confirmed at the current time the City had disconnected from Ingham County and assisting their staff.

Planning & Neighborhood Development

Council Member Houghton returned to the meeting at 6:59 p.m.

Council President Spitzley asked Mr. Johnson to follow the outline the Departments were presented with. Mr. Johnson handed out a power point presentation.

Council Member Dunbar stepped away from the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

In the presentation was the introductions of his staff, and overview of the department, and 5 items they have focused on including blight elimination, neighborhood support, “Love Lansing”, and the Form Based Code.

Council Member Dunbar returned to the meeting at 7:03 p.m.

Council President Spitzley passed the gavel at 7:03 p.m. to Council Member Wood

Mr. Johnson then went through his presentation highlighting those items and the tasks they have taken over the last year.

Council Member Wood passed the gavel to Council President Spitzley

Mr. Gamble returned to the meeting at 7:17 p.m.

Slide 26 was reviewed which showed the comparisons on the number of building safety permits that were issued, and then an overview of the time line on the progress at Life O’Riley.

Council Member Wood asked for the current list of staffing positions, the number that were vacant, and which ones were filled by temporary or contractual staff.

Council Member Wood then referred the Committee to page 27 of 44 in the budget which note non-general funds dollars, and an increase projected for the North Capital Ramp permits and decrease on for the Townsend Street lot. Mr. Johnson informed the Committee that all City Employees have moved to the North Capital lot, and they have also seen an increase of permitted use in that lot. The Townsend ramp saw a decrease in the budget from $1,100,000 to $300,000 because there was an original contract with the State of Michigan, but there are pending issues with that and the City is aggressively pursuing the resolution to that contract with the State. He added that BCBS has now moved all their employees to their private ramp, and no longer parking employees at Townsend either. Council Member Wood asked what the amount in the fund balance is for the ramp. Ms. Bennett stated $12.3 million. Mr. Johnson added that is about $130,000 - $150,000 for maintenance on a single ramp.

Council Member Wood then asked about the contractual item for the ramps. Ms. Shell they use contractors for the elevator, pest control, gate equipment and safety, in addition to cleaning and the plowing.

Council Member Hussain stepped away from the meeting at 7:27 p.m.

Council Member Wood asked what the rental rate was for the offices in the bottom of ramp. Mr. Johnson stated it is running at $11.00 per square foot, so roughly $9,000 for planning office; $37,000 for building safety, and code at $41,000.

Information Technology-(30 minutes)

Mr. Boyce went through his power point presentation with the Committee.

Council Member Brown Clarke asked if there was tracking on the projects in progress, and Mr. Boyce confirmed they have a new Help Ticket process and that has helped. The group was referred to slide 4 which outlined their time to resolution since 2014.

Slide 8 of the presentation was reviewed which lists the Information Technology projects with stability, workflow, support systems, security and 8 items “In Progress”. Mr. Boyce confirmed that in total there were 32 projects, they have finished 25 projects and two will continue past fiscal year.

Council Member Wood asked if the IT Department assisted with the HR new hiring process. Mr. Boyce confirmed they were involved in the tracking system, and provided the project management in order to get the new portal when people want to post the positions.

The group moved onto slide 9 which detailed the required performance indicators, those being Infrastructure – Uptime 99.99% for service availability; Service Desk – 80% of the tickets completed in one business day, and Feedback on tickets 4.9 out of 5.0.

Council President Spitzley asked about the cyber security. Mr. Boyce outlined their understand and noted that in 2016 there was an analysis of cyber security from an external firm audit. Their goal is to protect with monitoring 24/7. In 2018 they hope to go forward and hope to have a goal to inside protection. He admitted they did learn from the incident with BWL and their security breach.

Council Member Brown Clarke asked about their analytics. Mr. Boyce referred them to slide 13, which was a presentation on operational systems, open data, analysis and identifying the problems. There is a proposed Data Analysis position that is proposed for analyzing and monitoring the data. In addition to that position Mr. Boyce referred the Committee to page 14 of the power point which noted they have 16 employees, with 6 vacancies in which 4 were filled and 2 are in the progress of being filled.

Council Member Wood asked about their plans for the electronic FOIA process. Mr. Boyce confirmed the FOIA's will be saved electronically and follow the Retention Act. Council Member Wood then asked if there was a system for the public to view FOIA requests. Mr. Boyce stated again that they follow the records management policy and if it is a configurable perimeter. Council President Spitzley asked if there is a way for Law to flag information so to eliminate duplicate searches. Mr. Boyce confirmed it is possible if the information still exists in the system.

Council Member Houghton asked about the card system, and if the issues have been researched, and also what the new software was that he was budgeting for. Mr. Boyce stated the software is for a learning management system, and also the increase is to cover software for departments.

Council Member Wood asked if the increase in wages was to add more position and remove those from contracted employees with Dew Point. Mr. Boyce referred again to page 14 of the slides, and stated it is not for new with Dew Point, it is for the new Security Administrator, IT Application Manager, Helpdesk Manager and Senior Help Desk Technician. Also currently the administrative assistant is part time and they will move that position to full time. Council Member Wood asked how long the contract was with Dew Point, and Mr. Boyce confirmed it is renewed year to year, and is up June 2017. Council Member Wood asked if they are looking at other companies, or bringing those positions to City full time employees. Mr. Boyce stated bringing those positions into City jobs is not his best move, because Dew Point is a 24/7 service company, and he supports the work Dew Point has done so far.

Council Member Wood referred the Committee and Mr. Boyce to page 41 of 44 in the budget and asked about the telephone account, and why there was a $300,000 increase. Mr. Boyce stated it used to be in hardware maintenance in previous years, and address telecommunications, phone systems at the desk, and all internet connectivity.   There was also an increase for the purchase of new storage.

Council Member Dunbar asked about details on the increases for software in the IT budget, when each department also shows an increase. Mr. Boyce stated that when a department purchases software the IT manages. Council Member Dunbar encouraged them to divide items out in IT per department for transparency.

Council asked if the Contract line item increased because of Dew Point, and Mr. Boyce clarified it was $962,000 actual.

Council Member Washington again asked Mr. Boyce why if IT was budgeting for items, why the departments were also budgeting for those same items. Ms. Bennett answered that IT is an internal service fund. The funding source in their fund is the individual departments. The then referred everyone to page 41 which showed revenue outside of the general fund. There is $5.7 million dollars with an allocation to the departments. Council Member Washington asked why $5.7 million was being paid for by all other departments, and if so then why is IT not asking for anything out of the general fund. Mr. Boyce provided information that he was aware that across the country each user has an average cost of $7,480, so his opinion was that the City was 5% less than the National average.

Council Member Brown Clarke asked if they were still committing funds for outdated equipment. Mr. Boyce confirmed that has started to flatten out.

Council Member Dunbar encouraged the Administration in the future to describe the line items in more detail so it is transparent on where items are being charged to.

Council President Spitzley referred Mr. Boyce and Mr. Gamble to the Lansing Connects items, and reminded them that Council has been asking for a review and understanding of the program, and read-only access so they can address call and concerns when they receive requests from the residents. Mr. Boyce was asked to work with the appropriate department so that City Council can have an opportunity to have read- only access.

Ms. Bennett left the meeting at 8:25 p.m.

<u>Human Relations & Community Services</u>

Dr. Joan Jackson Johnson distributed her annual information, and outlined her department, grants, and community forums. Also noted were youth programming, transportation and resources for public housing. Council Member Wood pointed out that in the last budget there were funds for a housing position, and asked if that person was hired. Dr. Jackson Johnson confirmed they did offer it to someone, but they wanted more money, so they started the hiring process again, with the plans to fill it within another week. Council Member Wood asked for the impact on the decrease from the Health Department. Dr. Jackson Johnson stated they do free medical, and substance abuse, and work with the Health Department. The Health Department helps with the prescription and child care side. Council Member Wood then asked about the Lansing Housing Commission role. Dr. Jackson Johnson detailed that there are two funds, they took over supportive housing that St. Vincent's gave up and the match dollars are for mental health. The other $10,000 is for use with a tutor on literacy coalition at all sites. Council Member Wood asked what the Kids Connect budget was, and Dr. Jackson Johnson stated $275,000 and that $60,000 is from donations. Council Member Brown Clarke asked whose responsibility it is for grant management and reporting. Dr. Jackson Johnsons gave the name of Tony Young and Katrina Urista, and on the 20th of every month they get a financial statement from the agency and do a program report quarterly. Council Member Brown Clarke asked what impact the Federal cuts will have on HRCS and if they have a strategic plan. Dr. Jackson Johnson stated they are planning and working with other agencies to plan ahead.

Mayor and Community Media

Mr. Gamble provided an overview of the department responsibilities, a proposed .5% reduction, and a reduction in the personnel line due to less interns and temporary help. Mr. Cochran updated the Committee on the recent AT&T system, which now doubles the audience.

Council Member Washington stepped away from the meeting at 8:59 p.m.

In addition to online streaming, it is also on TV, and the public media goals include upgrades to the Council Chambers hearing assistance, upgrade to HD and web stream.

Council Member Washington returned to the meeting at 9:01 p.m.

Currently it is HD on the internet, but they are having discussion on a high speed app. The upgrades in the chambers will amount to an estimate of $100,000.

Council Member Wood asked how many employees were in the department for City TV, and Mr. Cochran confirmed there were two full time, but do have some assistance that help with input, so a total of 6 staff at time. They plan to have one staff dedicated to phones, questions, and customer service. Council Member Spitzley asked how many contract employees and the longest contract employee. Mr. Cochran confirmed 4 and the longest , has currently worked on contract for 5 years.

Council Member Yorko stepped away from the meeting at 9:07 p.m.

Council Member Wood asked why there was no rental costs noted for City TV at SWOC, since other departments such as the Parking Office, has a rental fee in their budget. Mr. Gamble stated those charges for City TV were in the property management line items. Council Member Wood asked why the franchise dollars were not paying utilities. She then also asked for performance measures from both the Mayor's office and the Media, before the budget is adopted.

Council Member Brown Clarke asked if there were plans to stream the meetings to an app on cell phones. Mr. Cochran stated they can currently stream it on their phone by logging into www. Stream.com and search for the Lansing City TV.

Council Member Yorko returned to the meeting at 9:11 p.m.

Council Member Hussain asked how many "back pack studios" they offered. Mr. Cochran confirmed they have 8 and currently most are rented regularly.

Council Member Yorko stepped away from the meeting at 9:13 p.m.

The estimated cost for each is $5,000, and over the 8 years since they were implemented they have not had any theft or damage. Council Member Hussain asked how they know they renters are not taping anything in appropriate. Mr. Cochran stated they have had no issues tracking the rentals.

Council Member Yorko returned to the meeting at 9:15 p.m.

The department can take screen shots of the web cam and the City Attorney opinion on the programming channel is that they are administrators and do not censor. Council President Spitzley asked about a legal opinion on anything inappropriate on a PEG channel, and how they control the content when they are using public equipment.

Council Member Yorko left the meeting at 9:16 p.m.

Mr. Cochran corrected himself, noting he did not mean they do not censor what goes online, the City channel only supports edited content.   The rentals are strictly used for non-commercial use and community events. They are aware that if they chose to do something it is a criminal charge. Council Member Brown Clarke asked if there was a rental fee, and what the cost is for the depreciation along with a fee model for the fee schedule. Mr. Cochran confirmed there is a rental fee, the funding is the PEF fees and that is why those funds cannot be used for operational expenses and capital expenditures.   Council Member Brown Clarke then asked if the renters are trained to use the cameras. Mr. Cochran confirmed.

Council President Spitzley reminded everyone of the two community meetings on May 3rd at Alfreda Schmidt South Side and May 4th at Foster Community Center. Lastly, a reminder that the Committee of the Whole meeting on May 8th will be held at 5:00 p.m.

<u>Adjourn</u>

Adjourned at 9:25 p.m.
Respectfully Submitted by,
Sherrie Boak, Recording Secretary
Lansing City Council
Approved by Committee on May 22, 2017